SAMPLE QUESTIONS PEER EDITORS CAN ANSWER

1. *Crux/problem/issue/thesis:* What is the writer talking about? Does he or she have an issue to work on? A problem to explore? Each reader should summarize for the author what the issue appears to be and what point(s) the author tries to make about it. Is the paper worth listening to? If the main idea seems to be silly or obvious, your responsibility is to (tactfully) discuss this with the writer.

2. *Look at the first paragraph.* Does it set up a good context for discussion of the topic? Does it make you want to read the essay? Compare the first and last paragraphs. Does the train appear to have arrived at the anticipated station? Is the destination interesting, stimulating?

3. Can you understand the essay without referring to your copy of the text(s) being discussed? Are quotations smoothly integrated into sentences and paragraphs?

4. Could a reader from another college read and appreciate this essay? If not, explain why.

5. *Organization:* Is the arrangement helpful? Clear? Effective for exploring the issue, accomplishing the goals of the essay? Go through your copy of the essay and make a rough (quick) outline of it in the margin (write down key words, note transitions). Make suggestions if sections seem out of place or seem to follow each other for no obvious reason, or if they don’t contribute to an understanding of the issue at hand.

6. *Evidence:* Are the ideas adequately developed? Can you provide additional ideas? Other examples? Anecdotes? Can you provide a clarifying metaphor? Do you have a different opinion about the subject? Explain: the writer will need to take account of your point of view.

7. Write down at least two substantial comments on the substance of the essay: give ideas for making a point clearer or more convincing, a suggestion for a good supporting quotation, a criticism of fact or of evidence, a criticism or further support of interpretation.

8. Did you learn something about the author, the audience, and the situation that elicited the essay? Comment on all three areas. Could this essay have a life outside this course? Discuss.

9. Does the essay make the writer’s ideas sound interesting? If so, point out where and how; if not, give some tips. (Think about figurative language, choice of verbs, liveliness of diction, and so on.)
10. **Tone:** What attitude does the writer seem to have toward the subject and/or toward the reader? Can/should the tone be made more pronounced? Should it be changed? Provide specific ideas.

11. **Style:** Where is the language especially effective? Point these spots out. Also point out anything that catches your ear as needing to be changed. Try to explain why.

12. Respond to the author’s two (or three) requests for help. Ask the author what kind of response he/she would like.